

APPENDIX A

TECHNICAL, THEORETICAL, AND/OR EMPIRICAL STUDIES, REPORTS OR DOCUMENTS

Albergetti, *Every employee who leaves Apple becomes an ‘associate’*, WASHINGTON POST (Feb. 10, 2022), available at <https://www.washingtonpost.com/technology/2022/02/10/apple-associate/>.

Berjon et al., Global Privacy Control (GPC) Proposal 27 January 2022, available at <https://globalprivacycontrol.github.io/gpc-spec/>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *Attorney General Bonta Announces First-Year Enforcement Update on the California Consumer Privacy Act, Launches New Online Tool for Consumers to Notify Businesses of Potential Violations*, Press Release (July 19, 2021), available at <https://oag.ca.gov/news/press-releases/attorney-general-bonta-announces-first-year-enforcement-update-california>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *California Consumer Privacy Act (CCPA) Website and Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs)*, available at <https://oag.ca.gov/privacy/ccpa>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *CCPA Enforcement Case Examples*, available at <https://oag.ca.gov/privacy/ccpa/enforcement>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *Consumer Privacy Interactive Tool*, available at <https://oag.ca.gov/consumer-privacy-tool>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *Final Statement of Reasons* (June 1, 2020), available at <https://oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/privacy/ccpa-fsor.pdf>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *Final Statement of Reasons, Appendix A. Summary and Response to Comments Submitted during 45-Day Period* (June 1, 2020), available at <https://oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/privacy/ccpa-fsor-appendix-a.pdf>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *Final Statement of Reasons, Appendix B. List of Commenters from 45-Day Period* (June 1, 2020), available at <https://oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/privacy/ccpa-fsor-appendix-b.pdf>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *Final Statement of Reasons, Appendix C. Summary and Response to Comments Submitted during 1st 15-Day Period* (June 1, 2020), available at <https://oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/privacy/ccpa-fsor-appendix-c.pdf>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *Final Statement of Reasons, Appendix D. List of Commenters from 1st 15-Day Period* (June 1, 2020), available at <https://oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/privacy/ccpa-fsor-appendix-d.pdf>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *Final Statement of Reasons, Appendix E. Summary and Response to Comments Submitted during 2nd 15-Day Period* (June 1, 2020), available at <https://oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/privacy/ccpa-fsor-appendix-e.pdf>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *Final Statement of Reasons, Appendix F. List of Commenters from 2nd 15-Day Period* (June 1, 2020), available at <https://oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/privacy/ccpa-fsor-appendix-f.pdf>.

California Department of Justice, Attorney General’s Office, *On Data Privacy Day, Attorney General Bonta Puts Businesses Operating Loyalty Programs on Notice for Violations of California Consumer Privacy Act*, Press Release (Jan. 28, 2022), available at <https://oag.ca.gov/news/press-releases/data-privacy-day-attorney-general-bonta-puts-businesses-operating-loyalty>.

California Privacy Protection Agency, Pre-Rulemaking Informational Sessions – Meeting Notice & Agenda, Meeting Materials, Transcripts, and Webcasts (Mar. 29-30, 2022), available at https://cppa.ca.gov/meetings/materials/20220229_30.html.

California Privacy Protection Agency, Stakeholder Sessions – Meeting Notice & Agenda, and Webcasts (May 4-6, 2022), available at https://cppa.ca.gov/meetings/materials/20220504_06.html.

California Privacy Protection Agency, Preliminary Rulemaking Activities: Written Public Comments (Part 1), available at https://cppa.ca.gov/regulations/pdf/preliminary_rulemaking_comments_1.pdf.

California Privacy Protection Agency, Preliminary Rulemaking Activities: Written Public Comments (Part 2), available at https://cppa.ca.gov/regulations/pdf/preliminary_rulemaking_comments_2.pdf.

California Privacy Protection Agency, Preliminary Rulemaking Activities: Written Public Comments (Part 3), available at https://cppa.ca.gov/regulations/pdf/preliminary_rulemaking_comments_3.pdf.

California Privacy Protection Agency, Preliminary Rulemaking Activities: Written Public Comments (Part 4), available at https://cppa.ca.gov/regulations/pdf/preliminary_rulemaking_comments_4.pdf.

Californians for Consumer Privacy, Annotated Text of the California Privacy Rights Act, available at <https://www.caprivacy.org/annotated-cpra-text-with-ccpa-changes/>.

Center for Plain Language, *Privacy-policy analysis* (2015), available at <https://centerforplainlanguage.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/TIME-privacy-policy-analysis-report.pdf>.

Chen et al., *Fighting the Fog: Evaluating the Clarity of Privacy Disclosures in the Age of CCPA* (Nov. 2021) WPES ’21: Proceedings of the 20th Workshop on Workshop on Privacy in the

Electronic Society, pp. 73-102, available at <https://dl.acm.org/doi/pdf/10.1145/3463676.3485601>.

Commission Nationale Informatiques et Libertés, *Cookies: 35 Million Euro Penalty Against Amazon Europe Core* (Dec. 10, 2020), available at <https://www.cnil.fr/fr/cookies-sanction-de-35-millions-deuros-lencontre-damazon-europe-core>.

Commission Nationale Informatiques et Libertés, *60 Million Euro Penalty Against Google LLC and 40 Million Euro Against Google Ireland Limited* (Dec. 10, 2020), available at <https://www.cnil.fr/fr/cookies-sanction-de-60-millions-deuros-lencontre-de-google-llc-et-de-40-millions-deuros-lencontre-de>.

Common Sense Media, *State of Kids' Privacy – Key Findings* (2021), available at <https://www.common sense media.org/sites/default/files/research/report/common-sense-2021-state-of-kids-privacy-key-findings.pdf>.

Competition & Markets Authority, *Evidence review of Online Choice Architecture and consumer and competition harm* (Apr. 5, 2022), available at <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/online-choice-architecture-how-digital-design-can-harm-competition-and-consumers/evidence-review-of-online-choice-architecture-and-consumer-and-competition-harm>.

Competition & Markets Authority, *Online Choice Architecture: How digital design can harm competition and consumers* (Apr. 2022), available at https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/1066524/Online_choice_architecture_discussion_paper.pdf.

Competition & Markets Authority, *Online platforms and digital advertising market study final report with appendices* (July 1, 2020), available at <https://www.gov.uk/cma-cases/online-platforms-and-digital-advertising-market-study>.

Consumer Action and Consumer Federation of America, *Survey Report: Too Many Californians Are Still Unaware of Privacy Rights* (2022), available at <https://www.consumer-action.org/downloads/english/CCPA-Privacy-Rights-Survey.pdf>.

Consumer Reports and EPIC, *How the FTC Can Mandate Data Minimization Through a Section 5 Unfairness Ruling* (Jan. 26, 2022), available at <https://epic.org/documents/how-the-ftc-can-mandate-data-minimization-through-a-section-5-unfairness-rulemaking/>.

Cranor et al., *CCPA Opt-Out Icon Testing – Phase 2* (May 28, 2020), available at <https://www.oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/privacy/dns-icon-study-report-052822020.pdf>.

Cranor et al., *Design and Evaluation of a Usable Icon and Tagline to Signal an Opt-Out of the Sale of Personal Information as Required by CCPA* (Feb. 4, 2020), available at <https://www.oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/privacy/cranor-design-eval-usable-icon.pdf>.

Cranor, *How Everyone Can Get the Online Privacy They Want*, WALL STREET JOURNAL (June 7, 2022), available at <https://www.wsj.com/articles/online-privacy-consent-11654540664>.

District of Columbia v. Google LLC, Complaint for Violations of the Consumer Protection Procedures Act (Jan. 24, 2022), available at <https://oag.dc.gov/sites/default/files/2022-01/DCv.Google%281-24-22%29.pdf>.

Federal Trade Commission, *A Look at What ISPs Know About You: Examining the Privacy Practices of Six Major Internet Service Providers* (Oct. 2021), available at http://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/reports/look-what-isps-know-about-you-examining-privacy-practices-six-major-internet-service-providers/p195402_isp_6b_staff_report.pdf.

Federal Trade Commission, *California Company Settles FTC Allegations It Deceived Consumers about use of Facial Recognition in Photo Storage App* (Jan. 11, 2021), Press Release, available at <https://www.ftc.gov/news-events/news/press-releases/2021/01/california-company-settles-ftc-allegations-it-deceived-consumers-about-use-facial-recognition-photo>.

Federal Trade Commission, *Enforcement Policy Statement Regarding Negative Option Marketing* (Oct. 28, 2021), available at http://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_statements/1598063/negative_option_policy_statement-10-22-2021-tobureau.pdf.

Flanagan, et al., World Economic Forum, *Redesigning Data Privacy Reimagining Notice & Consent for human-technology interaction* (July 2002), White Paper, available at http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_Redesigning_Data_Privacy_Report_2020.pdf.

Germain, *How to Spot Manipulative 'Dark Patterns' Online*, CONSUMER REPORTS (Jan. 30, 2019), available at <https://www.consumerreports.org/privacy/how-to-spot-manipulative-dark-patterns-online-a7910348794/>.

Global Privacy Control, *Frequently Asked Questions* (2022), available at <https://globalprivacycontrol.org/faq>.

Gray et al., *Dark Patterns and the Legal Requirements of Consent Banners: An Interaction Criticism Perspective* (Feb. 4, 2021), available at <https://arxiv.org/abs/2009.10194>.

Habib et al., *An Empirical Analysis of Data Deletion and Opt-Out Choices on 150 Websites* (2019) USENIX Symposium on Usable Privacy and Security (SOUPS), Aug. 11-13, 2019, Santa Clara, CA, USA, available at <https://www.usenix.org/conference/soups2019/presentation/habib>.

Habib, *Evaluating the Usability of Privacy Choice Mechanisms* (2021), Carnegie Mellon University, Thesis, available at <https://doi.org/10.1184/R1/17105468.v1>.

Habib et al., “*Okay, whatever*”: *An Evaluation of Cookie Consent Interfaces* (Apr. 2022), CHI ‘22: CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems, Article No. 621, pp. 1-27, available at <https://dl.acm.org/doi/abs/10.1145/3491102.3501985>.

Habib et al., *Toggles, Dollar Signs, and Triangles: How to (In)Effectively Convey Privacy Choices with Icons and Link Texts* (May 2021) CHI ‘21: Proceedings of the 2021 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems, Article No. 63, pp. 1-25, available at <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3411764.3445387>.

Kelly et al., *Americans widely distrust Facebook, TikTok and Instagram with their data, poll finds*, WASHINGTON POST (Dec. 22, 2021), available at <https://www.washingtonpost.com/technology/2021/12/22/tech-trust-survey/>.

King et al., *Regulating Privacy Dark Patterns in Practice – Drawing Inspiration from California Privacy Rights Act* (Sept. 2021), 5 Geo. L. Tech. Rev. 251 (2021), available at <https://georgetownlawtechreview.org/regulating-privacy-dark-patterns-in-practice-drawing-inspiration-from-california-privacy-rights-act/GLTR-09-2021/>.

Lomas, *France fines Google \$120M and Amazon \$42M for dropping tracking cookies without consent*, TECHCRUNCH (Dec. 10, 2020), available at <https://techcrunch.com/2020/12/10/france-fines-google-120m-and-amazon-42m-for-dropping-tracking-cookies-without-consent/>.

Luguri et al., *Shining a Light on Dark Patterns* (Mar. 23, 2021), Journal of Legal Analysis, Vol. 13, Issue 1, 2021, pp. 43-109, available at <https://doi.org/10.1093/jla/laaa006>.

Lupiáñez-Villanueva et al., Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers (European Commission), *Behavioural study on unfair commercial practices in the digital environment: dark patterns and manipulative personalisation* (Apr. 2022), available at <https://op.europa.eu/fr/publication-detail/-/publication/606365bc-d58b-11ec-a95f-01aa75ed71a1>.

Mahoney et al., Consumer Reports, *The State of Authorized Agent Opt Outs Under the California Consumer Privacy Act*, (Feb. 2021), available at https://advocacy.consumerreports.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/CR_AuthorizedAgentCCPA_022021_VF_.pdf.

Mahoney, Consumer Reports, *California Consumer Privacy Act: Are Consumers' Digital Rights Protected?* (Oct. 1, 2020), available at https://advocacy.consumerreports.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/CR_CCPA-Are-Consumers-Digital-Rights-Protected_092020_vf2.pdf.

Mathur et al., *Dark Patterns at Scale: Findings from a Crawl of 11K Shopping Websites* (Nov. 2019), Proc. ACM Hum.-Comput. Interact. 3, CSCW, Art. 81, available at <https://arxiv.org/pdf/1907.07032.pdf>.

Mazurov, *I Want You Back: Getting My Personal Data from Amazon was Weeks of Confusion and Tedium*, THE INTERCEPT (Mar. 27, 2022), available at <https://theintercept.com/2022/03/27/amazon-personal-data-request-dark-pattern/>.

Network Advertising Initiative, *Best Practices for User Choice and Transparency* (Apr. 2022), available at <https://thenai.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/NAI-Dark-Patterns-Final-5.12.22.pdf>.

Nortwick et al., *Setting the Bar Low: Are Websites Complying With the Minimum Requirements of the CCPA?* (Nov. 19, 2022), Proceedings on Privacy Enhancing Technology, Vol. 2022 (1), pp. 608-628, available at https://www.researchgate.net/publication/356421353_Setting_the_Bar_Low_Are_Websites_Complying_With_the_Minimum_Requirements_of_the_CCPA/fulltext/619be29ad7d1af224b194bf7/Setting-the-Bar-Low-Are-Websites-Complying-With-the-Minimum-Requirements-of-the-CCPA.pdf.

Nouwens et al., *Dark Patterns after the GDPR: Scraping Consent Pop-ups and Demonstrating their Influence* (Apr. 2020), CHI '20: Proceedings of the 2020 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems, pp. 1-13, available at <https://doi.org/10.1145/3313831.3376321>.

Null et al., Access Now, *Data Minimization: Key to Protecting Privacy and Reducing Harm* (May 2021), available at <https://www.accessnow.org/data-minimization-report/>.

O'Connor et al., *(Un)clear and (In)conspicuous: The right to opt-out of sale under CCPA* (July 14, 2021), available at <https://arxiv.org/abs/2009.07884>.

Office of the Privacy Commissioner of Canada, *Joint investigation into location tracking by the Tim Hortons App*, PIPEDA Findings #2022-001 (June 1, 2022), available at <https://www.priv.gc.ca/en/opc-actions-and-decisions/investigations/investigations-into-businesses/2022/pipeda-2022-001/>.

Schaub et al., *A Design Space for Effective Privacy Notices* (2015), Symposium on Usable Privacy and Security (SOUPS) 2015, July 22-24, 2015, Ottawa, Canada, available at <https://www.usenix.org/system/files/conference/soups2015/soups15-paper-schaub.pdf#:~:text=Based%20on%20a%20survey%20of%20existing%20literature%20and,reasoning%20about%20opportunities%20for%20privacy%20notices%20and%20controls>.

Sevilla et al., *Unaccounted Privacy Violation: A Comparative Analysis of Persistent Identification of Users Across Social Contexts* (2020), available at https://www.ftc.gov/system/files/documents/public_events/1548288/privacycon-2020-ido_sivan-sevilla.pdf.

Tufekci, *We Need to Take Back Our Privacy*, NEW YORK TIMES (May 19, 2022), Opinion, available at <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/05/19/opinion/privacy-technology-data.html>.

Waldman, *How Big Tech Turns Privacy Laws into Privacy Theater*, SLATE (Dec. 2, 2021), available at <https://slate.com/technology/2021/12/facebook-twitter-big-tech-privacy-sham.html>.

World Wide Web Consortium, *Web Content Accessibility Guidelines (WCAG) 2.1* (2018), available at <https://www.w3.org/TR/WCAG21/>.

Zakrzewski, *Google deceived consumers about how it profits from their location data, attorneys general allege in lawsuits*, WASHINGTON POST (Jan. 24, 2022), available at <https://www.washingtonpost.com/technology/2022/01/24/google-location-data-ags-lawsuit/>.